

ASHLAND HISTORIC COMMISSION

Meeting Minutes

August 6, 2014

Community Development/Engineering Services Building – 51 Winburn Way – Siskiyou Room

- I. **Regular meeting, call to order:** 6:05p.m. – SISKIYOU ROOM in the Community Development/Engineering Services Building, located at 51 Winburn Way
Historic Commissioners Present: Mr. Skibby, Ms. Renwick, Mr. Whitford, Mr. Swink, Mr. Shostrom, Mr. Giordano
Commission Members Absent: Ms. KenCairn(E), Ms. Law (U)
Council Liaison: Mike Morris, absent
Staff Present: Staff Liaison: Amy Gunter, Clerk: Regan Trapp
- II. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES:** Historic Commission regular meeting of July 2, 2014. Ms. Renwick approved the minutes from July 2, 2014, and Mr. Swink seconded. Motion passed unanimously.
- III. **PUBLIC FORUM:** There was no one wishing to speak.
- IV. **COUNCIL LIAISON REPORT:** No council liaison was present to give the report.
- V. **PLANNING ACTION REVIEW:** Mr. Skibby read aloud the requirements for public hearings.

PLANNING ACTION: 2014-00710

SUBJECT PROPERTY: 143 Nutley Street

APPLICANT/OWNER: Robert Baldwin

DESCRIPTION: A request for a Conditional Use Permit (CUP) approval to exceed maximum permitted floor area (MPFA) in the Skidmore Academy Historic District for the addition of 1,695 square feet on to the existing 896 square foot residence on the property at 143 Nutley Street. The request is to exceed the allowed MPFA of 2,591 square feet by 13.29 percent or 306 square feet.

COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION: Single Family Residential; **ZONING:** R-1-7.5;

ASSESSOR'S MAP: 39 1E 08AD **TAX LOTS:** 2300.

Mr. Skibby opened the public hearing for staff comments. Ms. Gunter gave the staff report. The conditions of approval for this addition include the Historic Commission's recommendations. Staff is recommending a tree protection and preservation plan as well as arborist recommendations for the relocation of the driveway and its potential impacts on the two trees on the adjacent lot. They are to continue the sidewalk at 5 feet, curbside to the property line.

Mr. Skibby opened the public hearing.

Gary Caperna, Architect, 2908 Hillcrest Road, Medford, OR 97504.

Mr Caperna showed the commission the plot lines from the county surveyors and said there is a discrepancy but that the lot is 60 X 110. He discussed the plans in depth and stated that they have maintained most of the historic standards in the new addition. They are replacing all the windows in the house with double hung windows with no divided lighting. Mr. Whitford asked if the 2nd floor was finished space and Mr. Caperna said that there are 2 attic style bedrooms but they are not a very usable space. He stated that they would be used as storage rooms. He said that they are not redoing the upstairs space but instead, making it attic space. There was some discussion on how much of the attic ceiling is actually 7 feet and it was determined that a separate condition of approval could be to leave the attic space as is. Mr. Caperna said that significant disruption would occur if they messed with the footings and the structure of the building. That is why they decided to make the addition in the back.

Mr. Skibby closed the public hearing. Mr. Skibby stated that this project has evolved quite a bit from where it started and likes that they saved the original house and the façade. Mr. Swink liked the detached garage hidden away from the front of the house and said it keeps the focus on

the house. Mr. Swink also stated that it is a nice continuation of a historic home. Mr. Giordano said that he likes the sharing of the driveway. Ms. Renwick motioned to approve PA-2014-00710 and Mr. Swink seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

PLANNING ACTION: 2014-00711

SUBJECT PROPERTY: 135 Nutley Street

APPLICANT/OWNER: Robert Baldwin

DESCRIPTION: A request for a Conditional Use Permit (CUP) approval to exceed maximum permitted floor area (MPFA) in the Skidmore Academy Historic District for the addition of 1,220 square feet on to the existing 856 square foot residence on the property at 135 Nutley Street. The request is to exceed the allowed MPFA of 1,821 square feet by 14.5 percent or 264 square feet.

COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION: Single Family Residential; **ZONING:** R-1-7.5;

ASSESSOR'S MAP: 39 1E 08AD **TAX LOTS:** 2300.

Ms. Gunter gave a report on the planning action. Mr. Skibby opened the public hearing.

Gary Caperna, Architect, 2908 Hillcrest Road, Medford, OR 97504.

Mr. Caperna stated that once again they are dealing with a small compact lot. They are utilizing the single driveway. He said they have changed the plans quite a bit from the original, to more of a bungalow style. He stated that part of the mass issue is the sloped property and that it does exaggerate the building mass on the downhill side. The plates have been dropped down, on one side of the house, to 7ft to try to carve out the building mass and use the hill. Mr. Caperna said they are keeping a dormer style gable to tie it all in but that they did get rid of some of the gables. Mr. Skibby stated that this is a big improvement from the original plans. Mr. Giordano said that the porch height should be lowered because it's physically small and small in regards to the front elevation. There was much discussion on the bulk and scale of the windows. Mr. Skibby closed the public hearing.

Mr. Skibby closed the public hearing. The Commission recommended reducing the porch height by approximately one foot to be even with the freeze board. Lowering the bedroom window bay on the right to be even with the gutter line and use the straight cut concrete shingles. Mr. Giordano motioned to approve PA-2014-00711. Mr. Shostrom seconded, no one opposed. Motion passed unanimously.

PLANNING ACTION: 2014-01283

SUBJECT PROPERTY: 172 Skidmore

APPLICANT/OWNER: Val Bachmayer

DESCRIPTION: A request for a Conditional Use Permit to operate a five-unit (four guest units and one owner's unit) Travelers Accommodation, and a Site Review Permit request for 343 square feet of additional space added to the main structure for the property located at 172 Skidmore. A 301 square foot first floor addition to the owner's residence is proposed as a common dining room, while a 42 square foot second floor addition would expand an existing dormer on the south elevation. **COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION:** Low-Density Multi-family; **ZONING:** R-2; **ASSESSOR'S MAP:** 39 1E 05DD; **TAX LOT:** 1000;

Ms. Gunter gave her staff report. Mr. Skibby opened the public hearing

Val Bachmeyer, Owner of 172 Skidmore, Ashland, OR 97520. Ms. Bachmeyer stated that she wants to expand the living and dining area and have a gathering room for up to 18 people. One side of the expansion will be set up for a common area. Ms. Bachmeyer presented the commission with pictures of the property and explained what her expansion entails. Mr. Skibby closed the public hearing.

Mr. Skibby said that it will blend in nicely with the neighborhood and really liked the historical marker in the yard. Mr. Swink says the windows on the corners look contemporary and Ms. Bachmeyer stated that she wants to use the existing windows due to finances. It was suggested by the Commission that Ms. Bachmeyer, use the existing windows and move them 2 feet from the corner. Mr. Whitford motioned to approve with the above condition and Mr. Swink seconded. No one opposed. Motion passed unanimously.

VI. **OLD BUSINESS:**

None

VII. **NEW ITEMS:**

- A. Ms. Gunter explained the election rules for public office to the commission.
- B. Ms. Gunter stated that Sept 9, 2014 is the CLG training but no time has been finalized as of yet. The training will be held at the Carnegie Library in Medford. Ms. Gunter said that she suggested that in the training they address demolitions and bring proof of ones that have been legally challenged. Ms. Gunter said that she would like to address how we can tighten up our code on demolition permits that are not required and should we add a level of review to these.

VIII. **DISCUSSION ITEMS:**

Mr. Shostrom reported that the city dug up bricks at Pioneer hall and it's trenched with asphalt. Ms. Gunter said that she will ask about this work being done and report back to the Commission.

IX. **COMMISSION ITEMS NOT ON AGENDA**

Ms. Gunter said that The Historic Commission did not receive funding from Travel Oregon for the grant she applied for.

Ms. Gunter told the commission about the progress of the Downtown Design Committee and said that now is an appropriate transition time if another commissioner was interested. It was suggested that Mr. Whitford take over as the representative for these meetings

The Commission discussed the Restore Oregon email that was received. It is the 2014 Heritage Barn Workshop and will be Saturday September 27, 2014 from 9:30am – 4pm at Hanley Farm in Central Point, OR.

A. **Review Board Schedule**

Aug 7th	Keith, Allison, Victoria
Aug 14th	Tom, Sam, Kerry
Aug 21st	Terry, Victoria, Dale
Aug 28th	Terry, Sam, Allison
Sept 4 th	Keith, Allison

B. **Project Assignments for Planning Actions:**

PA-2014-00725	121 Manzanita-Under construction	Whitford
PA-2014-00725	469 Allison-Under construction	Swink
PA-2014-00710/711	143/135 Nutley	Swink and Whitford
PA-2014-01283	172 Skidmore	Shostrom
BD-2013-00256	175 Lithia Way – Under construction	Giordano
PA-2014-00251	30 S. First St. – No new permits issued	Whitford
PA-2014-00491	566 Fairview St. – Under construction/almost done	Shostrom
BD-2013-00813	374 Hargadine – Under construction/almost done	Swink
PA-2013-01388	14 Calle Guanajuato(Sandlers) Restaurant-Under construction/almost done	Renwick
PA-2013-01421	270 N. First St.(Nisha Jackson)- Building permit issued	Renwick
PA-2013-01829	60 Alida St. (Lieberman) - Complete	Shostrom
PA-2013-01828	310 Oak St. (Thompson) – No new permits issued	Shostrom

ANNOUNCEMENTS & INFORMATIONAL ITEMS:

Next meeting is scheduled for September 3, 2014, 6:00 pm.

There being no other items to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 8:09pm

Respectfully submitted by Regan Trapp

**CITY OF
ASHLAND
TREE COMMISSION MINUTES
September 4, 2014**

CALL TO ORDER – Ashland Tree Commission meeting was called to order at 6:04 p.m. on September 4, 2014 in the Siskiyou Room in the Community Development and Engineering Services Building located at 51 Winburn Way, Ashland, Oregon.

Commissioners Present	Council Liaison
Ken Schmidt - Absent	Carol Voisin
Gregg Trunnell	Staff
Russ Neff	Michael Pina, Planning liaison
Casey Roland	
Christopher John	

APPROVAL OF MINUTES - Neff motioned, and John seconded the motion, to approve the July 7, 2014 regular meeting minutes and the motion carried unanimously.

WELCOME GUESTS & PUBLIC FORUM

No guests

PLANNING ACTION REVIEW

PLANNING ACTION: PA-2014-01226
SUBJECT PROPERTY: 345 Lithia Way
APPLICANT: Double R Products
OWNER: Hays Oil
DESCRIPTION: A request for a Site Review approval to convert the Lithia Way Texaco located at 345 Lithia Way into a retail and restaurant establishment that sells growlers.
COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION: Commercial; **ZONING:** C-1;
ASSESSOR’S MAP: 39 1E 09BD; **TAX LOTS:** 1801

All commissioners visited the site. No ex parte contacts declared. Piña gave a brief staff report outlining the application’s proposal to convert the existing gas station into a retail/restaurant establishment. The applicant will remove the pump island, canopy, and the air and vacuum stations, as well as decommission the underground gasoline storage tanks. The car wash bay will converted to the equipment and storage area, while the existing retail area will be enlarged through to the conversion of the mechanic bay to additional retail/restaurant area. In deliberating the request, the Tree Commission provided the following recommendations: That a revised size- and species- specific landscape and irrigation plan be submitted with building permit submittals. That the proposed street tree’s be chosen from the Lithia Way Tree list, be staggered from one-another, and be fitted with perforated sleeve to protect the bark.

Trunnell motioned, John seconded, to approve the application as presented with the following recommendation: That a revised size- and species- specific landscape and irrigation plan be submitted with building permit submittals. That the proposed street tree’s be chosen from the



Lithia Way Tree list, be staggered from one-another, and be fitted with perforated sleeve to protect the bark. The motion carried unanimously.

PLANNING ACTION: PA-2014-01499
SUBJECT PROPERTY: 157 Garfield St.
APPLICANT: Canopy LLC
OWNER: Sue Lawrence
DESCRIPTION: A Tree Removal Permit request to remove an approximate 26-inch DBH Mulberry tree from the rear yard of the property located at 157 Garfield St. The tree has been topped multiple times causing an increased possibility of failure.
COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION: Low-Density Multi-Family; **ZONING:** R-2;
ASSESSOR'S MAP: 39 1E 10CB **TAX LOT:** 3601

All commissioners visited the site. No ex parte contacts declared. Piña gave a brief staff report noting that the application proposes to remove a single 26-inch DBH Mulberry tree from the rear yard of one of the units. The applicant's findings state that the tree has been severely topped multiple times over the years, causing the tree to have a poor structure with weak attachments, and subsequently an increased risk of failure. Therefore attempting to restructure the tree via pruning is not an option. In deliberating the request, the Tree Commission was supportive of the request, however a specific mitigation tree what not proposed, therefore the Commission recommended that a minimum three-inch caliper tree be chosen as a replacement tree, or multiple trees at the minimum size of 1.5-inches, with irrigation.

Neff motioned, John seconded, to approve the application as presented, with the recommendation that a minimum three-inch caliper tree be chosen as a replacement tree, or multiple trees at the minimum size of 1.5-inches, with irrigation. The motion carried unanimously.

PLANNING ACTION: PA-2014-01474
SUBJECT PROPERTY: 943-949 East Main
APPLICANT: Gabino Remigio
OWNER: Ron DeLuca
DESCRIPTION: A Tree Removal Permit request to remove 13 trees of varying species, all greater than six-inches DBH, from the property located at 943-949 East Main Street. Twelve Cedar and Cypress trees were removed prior to approval. The remaining tree is an approximate 30-inch Maple tree is located in the front yard between the parking lot and structure.
COMPREHENSIVE PLAN DESIGNATION: Low-Density Multi-Family; **ZONING:** R-2;
ASSESSOR'S MAP: 39 1E 09AD **TAX LOT:** 3801

All commissioners visited the site. No ex parte contacts declared. Piña gave a brief staff report indicating that the applicant requests a retroactive approval for the removal of twelve trees without permits, and an additional removal request for a 36-inch Maple tree located between the parking area and building along the East Main frontage. The difficulty in reviewing this proposal is that being constructed in 1965, staff does not have an approved landscape plan on file, therefore, we have nothing in which to compare the proposal to. Nevertheless, AMC 18.042.D requires an Tree Removal Permit for all trees greater than six-inches Diameter at Brest Height (DBH) within a multi-family zone. In speaking with the applicant, the trees removed were a mix of five Leland Cypress along the building's east elevation, and five volunteer Cedars along north building's northern elevation, and two within a nine-by-ten landscape area between the two buildings. The applicant asserted that he was unaware that removal of the aforementioned trees required a permit.



Piña noted that in similar situations, planning staff has issued citations for removal without permits. However in this case, since the applicant is requesting a permit for one of the trees on-site, staff would rather have compliance than enforcement on tree removal and replacements. In deliberating the request, the Tree Commission felt that the property owner should have been aware of tree removal requirements on multi-family zoned properties, or at least inquired with staff to what the process is for removing trees. However, if the applicant had come before the Commission to request removal prior to removing the trees, the commission and staff would have likely approved the request based upon the materials presented. However as this is not the case, it is difficult for staff to assess the potential impact or removing the trees on this and adjacent properties. Therefore, the Commission recommended that the applicant come back before the commission with a mitigation and irrigation plan for this property and any other off-site mitigation for their review. As for the requested Maple, the Commission agreed with the applicant in that the tree presents a potential danger to pedestrians by creating a tripping hazard, and due to its aggressive root structure can will cause damage to the building and utility systems, therefore removal is approved.

Trunell motioned, Neff seconded, to continue the application at the next hearing, so that the applicant can develop a revised landscape and irrigation plan for this property and others in common ownership in which mitigation trees will be planted. The motion carried unanimously.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Commission Roland, whom was absent last meeting, spoke about a replacement tree for the one in the plaza. Roland thought that perhaps rather than one single tree, a group of multiple trees placed in a way as to provide a greater canopy of shade may be another option. Piña stated that could be an option, but noted at the previous meeting, the Commission discussed this very topic and made a recommendation of a minimum four- to six-inches DBH, preferably a Burr or Red Oak; contain an appropriate amended soil mixture; planted in the fall according to City specifications.

Commission Chair Trunell, whom was absent last meeting, discussed the need for standardized tree protection procedures on all city projects, equal to or greater than those the planning division requires of the public. Piña noted that at the previous meeting, the Commission also discussed this topic, and made a recommendation, however Trunell pointed out that a motion was made to this specified point.

Trunell motioned, Roland seconded, that on all city projects within the right-of-way, that the City follows the same if not greater tree protection measures the planning division requires of the public. The motion carried unanimously.

LIAISON REPORTS

Carol Voisin, City Council Liaison – Voisin updated the Commission on the work of the City Beautification Committee, and that the committee is seeking input from the Tree Commission on six areas downtown. These will be brought forth to the Tree Commission for their review in the coming months.

COMMISSIONER REPORTS

Meeting adjourned at 8:15 p.m.

Respectively submitted by Assistant Planner Michael Piña

